

Cross-examining similarity and variance between Hinduism and Judaism

Dr. D. Vallabh
Walter Sisulu University
South Africa
Email: dvallabh@wsu.ac.za

Abstract

Many attempts have been made to show similarities between Hinduism and Judaism. This article based on a literature review unpacks some similarities between Brahmins and Jews for example, both groups viewed themselves as 'God's select' people. Both religions have special communities of priests and both religions play a profound role in global history. There are also numerous equivalents in terms of characters found in the Hebrew Holy Scriptures and the Hindu Upanishads. While there are numerous points of difference, the main variance between Hinduism and Judaism is however, theological in nature, with the Jews being totally against the use of images that most Hindus use and which Jews consider to be 'graven images'. Hinduism and Judaism are comparable in their propensity toward orthopraxy as opposed to orthodoxy. While Hinduism asserts that god is the universe, the universe is not the God. Judaism by contrast says the universe is possessed by God, who is a super natural being.

Keywords: Hinduism, Judaism, religion, faith, synergy

Introduction

Judaism as one of the earliest religions and it is monotheistic. It bears a resemblance to Hinduism. The similarities are intriguing. The Jewish faith profoundly believes in the reality of one God, who completed a covenant, with the Jews. They were assured of prosperity so long as they obeyed the rules and did not deviate from them. The rules by which humanity was expected to serve the Creator were originally written on two stone tablets and we know them as The Decalogue (Ten Commandments). Hinduism by contrast is neither polytheistic or monotheistic in essence since it asserts a fundamental faith in the Universal spirit. Hindus thus believe in several deities which are all reflections of the one Supreme Being - Brahman or the Universal Spirit. Hinduism maintains that all that happens in the universe is cyclic in nature. The world has thus been forged, sustained, and demolished many times. The god being manifests in three forms: Brahma, who shaped the world, Vishnu, who sustains and Shiva, who destroys the universe and then the cycle repeats itself. Hindu people commonly worship Vishnu and Shiva. Vishnu is described as being kind and desires to protect the happiness of humanity. Vishnu descends from the heavens to earth in a physical form every time a major cataclysm faces the cosmos or indeed if humankind requires consolation and guidance (Woodhead, 2007).

Vishnu is extremely aligned with humanity, while Shiva is disconnected. He meditates alone and is a supreme being beyond good and evil. He saves mankind by eradicating human sins. Judaism as well as Hinduism both assert that God is omnipresent and omnipotent; He is the creator, the protector and also the destroyer or god of wrath. Human fate thus relies heavily on the will of God and nothing ever moves without His actions. The Jewish scriptures describe a vivid vision of God. "His head is a treasure of fine gold. His locks are hanging, black like the

raven." In both the Talmudic and Kabbalistic traditions, one of the explanations is that a vision of God is when: "when He is visualized in battle, He is seen as a young man with black hair." (Sepher Yetzirah- Book of Creation, Ch. 6.1). The Hindu Vedas refer to the form of the Lord as well. In the Srimad-Bhagavatam it is said: "the Lord is super excellently beautiful on account of His open and merciful smile and His sidelong glance upon His devotees. His black hair is curly, and His garments, waving in the wind, appear like flying saffron pollen from lotus flowers. His glittering earrings, shining helmet, bangles, garland, ankle bells, waist belt and various other bodily ornaments combine with the conch shell, disc, club, and lotus flower to increase the natural beauty of the Kaustubha pearl on His chest." (Srimad-Bhagavatam 2.24.47-48; Gupta and Valpey, 2013).

If we consider social practices, both Jews and Hindus are highly open-minded religions. Neither religion encourages conversion, nor do both incorporate a belief system and also a culture. They are both thus in a sense ethnically-based religions, and do not in any sense endorse conversion. In addition, both religions are globally significant (Tomalin, 2012: 109). Goodman asserts that Hinduism and Judaism have played a significant role in European deliberations on issues of *inter alia* idolatry, spirituality, primitive, theories of race, language and mythologies (Goodman, 1994: 3). Hinduism grew from two ancient cultural developments, the Indus Valley civilization (c. 2500–1500 BCE) and the Aryan culture (c. 1800–1500 BCE). There is a relationship between these two ancient cultures which is mutually reinforcing to an extent.

Hinduism has given birth to Buddhism and Jainism, and, similarly Judaism is the mother of Christianity and Islam. Both religions experienced the persecution of intolerant rulers and also have been subject to the holocaust during colonial times. Both of their religions were revealed (Sinha & Sinha, 2014). According to the Hindu ancient belief, Hinduism does not have a beginning. Similarly, Moses did not create the Holy Books as they were revealed. God is the source of both the Jews and Hindu traditions. Moses did not create the religion. Similarly, in the Hindu tradition it is said that even Rama or Krishna didn't create the religion. Ancient Indian religious books are divided in four Vedas and similarly Jews have five Holy Books. There are Smritis standing as codes to be followed and Jews have Midrash. Both religions prescribe removing shoes at the temple. Both take a ritual bath before special rites. The outer purity is needed to cultivate inner purity (Sinha & Sinha, 2014). Both Hinduism and Judaism are revealed religions but Hinduism does not have a commencement time since Dharma or the eternal law of the cosmos which is inherent in the very nature of all things is eternal. The Vedas are then not mere books, but rather divine revelations by Rishis or saints who are seers of the mantras, and not its authors. Vedas are also revealed. In Judaism, Moses did not create the Decalogue, but it was revealed. God is then the prime source of both the Jewish and Hindu religions. In the Jewish faith tradition, there is Yom Kippur, while Hindus celebrate Navaratri. Both, Hindus and Jews, seek atonement with the creator by prayer and fasting.

Jews keep Kosher while the Hindus have what is called "Achara" both refer to strict codes about internal and external purity. Both are pure in food and do not mix certain types of food or eat old food. Both of religions prescribe purification before going to their holy shrine. During the menstrual period, both Jewish and Hindu women abstain from worship (Sinha & Sinha, 2014). They have lunar calendars in both traditions. The number of years in their calendars are the same. For marriages and other auspicious events, different days are seen. Both perform marriages under canopies. Some of the marriage rights are similar. Both of them also have corresponding festivals. In the Jewish tradition, they have Yom Kippur, and in India Hindus celebrate Navaratri; both religions observe fasting and conduct special prayers at the time. The festivals of Purim and Holi, observed during springtime, signify triumph of good over evil in both traditions. When both do a blessing, they use rice as the symbol of fertility. In the

past, it is said that Jews used to rub ash on the body to purify themselves, similarly, Hindus also use ash to purify their bodies. Both of them have two important rivers: Jordan and Ganga, which have a strong religious significance (Sinha & Sinha, 2014).

Critically, neither religion has embarked on belligerent campaigns and sent armies on any holy wars or even pursued a policy of imposing their religion on others by the force as has been done by Christians during the Crusades nor Muslims with their Jihadist approach. The Jews and also the Hindus show deference to other religions, and this applies to even those which are highly dissimilar in their observances. Neither religion claims that theirs is the only true religion (Frawley, 1995). Dubashi elucidates that Jews and Hindus had similar political aspirations and both attained independence from their colonial overlords in 1948. Just as the Hindus yearned for their own state, so did the Jews. Neither group was happy to sit back and simply tolerate being ruled by foreigners (Dubashi, 1987).

A great range of diversity exists among people who consider themselves to be Hindu. To be born a Hindu in India means entering the caste system which is one of the world's longest surviving forms of social stratification. This system has been embedded in the Indian culture for the past 1,500 years. The caste system follows a basic precept that all people are created unequal (National Geographic, 2003). There are thus many types of Hindus. The ranks in Hindu society come from a legend in which the main groupings, or Varnas, emerge from a primordial being. The Brahmins represent the priests and teachers; the Kshatriyas represent the rulers and soldiers; the Vaisyas represent the merchants and traders; the Sudras represent the labourers and the Achuta, or untouchables are outcasts. These outcasts are considered to be impure and polluted, to rank as worthy beings. Each Varna in turn contains hundreds of hereditary castes and sub-castes with their own pecking order (National Geographic, 2003). There are over 325 languages which are expressed in an additional roughly 2,000 dialects and 25 handwritings. Hinduism has neither a recognized founder nor a single defining creed, "It has no central authority, nor a fixed pantheon, neither a universally accepted scripture nor a seamless system of beliefs" (Alexandru-Corneliu, 2015: 164-165).

Hindu worshippers pray a great deal and incessant recitation of god's name is believed to lead to a cleansing of the mind and internal catharsis. It leads to closer links with the Creator. In Judaism prayers are also offered daily such as Shacharit in the morning, Minchah and Maariv, in the late afternoon and early evening. The Jews pray "Hear, O Israel! The Lord is our God! The Lord is One!" (Van Voorst, 2010). Prayer is an essential part of life in both faiths. In Hinduism prayers are directed to gods, supernatural spirits and goddesses but in Judaism prayers are focused on only God. Both Judaism and Hinduism believe in life after death. Jews have the proposition of Heaven as their afterlife if they please God, and shall then spend eternity in Heaven. Hindus believe that you are reincarnated until you reach the Brahma. Hindus believe in Karma which is essentially the belief that if you do good things, then good things shall happen to you as well. When one dies their final death in Hinduism, they reach the Brahma where the agonizing system of regeneration is finally abandoned. A person's caste affiliation is a strong indication of how close he or she is to the desired reunion with the Creator. Both religions teach people how to live a truthful life, and how to be caring to others while they are living on the Earth. Both religions have sacred locations such as Jerusalem and Haridwar, where pilgrimages are undertaken by the faithful.

Historic links

From the historical evidence it is clear that there was trade between ancient India and Israel. In this relationship, the Phoenicians played an important role, predominantly during the reign of King Solomon, who was arguably the most eminent of the Jewish kings other than King David. "For the king had Tarshish ships in the sea together with the ships of Hiram; once every three years the Tarshish ships arrived, carrying gold and silver, elephant tusks, monkeys and peacocks" (The Bible, 1956: 349). It is most likely that the Biblical authors were referring to India where the trade in animals including monkeys and peacocks was common (Goodman, 1994: 28). There is a Buddhist account of Indian traders visiting Baveru in Babylonia and vending peacocks for public exhibition (Cornille, 2013: 417).

Earlier accounts describe monkeys for sale being displayed to the community (Goodman, 1994: 25). In reviewing literature on the theme, it is apparent that there were advanced trade links between India and Palestine and the various Jewish communities in the Mediterranean region which were sustained. The result was that gradually even the languages of these cultures began to share some linguistic similarities (Goodman, 1994: 26-27). There was undoubtedly a meeting of minds and a vigorous exchange of ideas between Hindus and Jews. It is believed that a number of Jewish communities departed for India where they found protection and so there have been extensive transactions between Hinduism and Judaism (Frawley, 2009: 16). Trade relations have been traced back to 1000 BCE and even earlier periods, in which the Harappa and Mohenjo-Daro cultures existed on the Indian subcontinent while the Babylonian culture dominated the Middle East. Jews have a rich heritage of numerous Jewish kings ruling Israel such as David, Solomon, Hezekiah, Rehoboam, Jeroboam and the Hindus have Kings in their epics as well including inter-alia Lord Rama, King Arjuna, etc., as well in History such as king Porus who fought Alexander the Great, and others such as Shivaji.

Old Testament studies are useful for sketching the history and culture of the Middle East and Asia and the Old Testament is additionally helpful for promoting greater understanding of the relations between Judaism and Hinduism (Kapoor, 2002: 2939). Throughout the second millennium B.C., Syria was under the rule of the Mittani, who were in essence an Indo-European group partaking in the worship of Vedic Gods. There are also numerous anecdotes of trade in antiquity as well as cross-cultural communication between India and the Levant. This is documented in The Periplus of the Erythraean Sea (Περίπλους τῆς Ἐρυθρᾶς Θαλάσσης) which described navigation and trading opportunities from the many Roman Egyptian ports such as Berenice along the coast of the Red Sea, and various other ports along the Northeast African coast and the Sindh and South western India. This text has been attributed to diverse dates between the 1st and 3rd centuries CE. The anonymous author was clearly familiar with the area and provided very precise perceptions into what the ancient European world knew about the lands around the Indian Ocean (see Figure 1). There are also various accounts pertaining to the illustrious Queen of Sheba in the Hebrew Bible, who may have dwelt in modern-day Ethiopia.

The extensive trade with the Indian harbour of Barygaza is widely pronounced in the Periplus. According to Prasad (1988), Nahapana, ruler of the Indo-Scythian Western Satraps is mentioned under the name of Nambanus and described as the ruler of the area around Barigaza:

41. "Beyond the gulf of Baraca is that of Barygaza and the coast of the country of Ariaca, which is the beginning of the Kingdom of Nambanus and of all India. That part of it lying inland and adjoining Scythia is called Abiria (from the nomadic tribe of Abhiras), but the coast is called Syraстrene

(Sanskrit - Saurashtra). It is a fertile country, yielding wheat and rice and sesame oil and clarified butter, cotton and the Indian cloths made therefrom, of the coarser sorts. Very many cattle are pastured there, and the men are of great stature and black in color. The metropolis of this country is Minnagara (Sanskrit - Meena Nagar- Fish Town, probably because fish was an important symbol of the Scythians?), from which much cotton cloth is brought down to Barygaza."

— *Periplus of the Erythraean Sea, Chap. 41 in (Schoff, 1912).*

According to Strabo (Στράβων) who lived in Asia Minor in 64 or 63 BC – c. 24 BCE and who was a the Greek geographer, philosopher, and historian a shipwrecked Indian sailor was discovered almost dead by coast guards plying the Red Sea, and was brought to the King. The Indian accepted to direct the King's navigators on a journey to India. Eudoxus of Cyzicus, who was a daring Greek seaman employed by Ptolemy VIII for navigation up the Nile, was appointed for that assignment. Poseidonius reports two direct journeys to India. The first was in 118 BC, directed by the Indian sailor, and this was fruitful. Eudoxus returned with a consignment of aromatics and precious stones. The second trip to India, under the guidance of Eudoxus, ensued in 116 B.C. after Ptolemy VIII reposed and was undertaken during the reign of Cleopatra III. (Strabo, 2.33. 4–5 in Roller, 2014).



Figure 1. Egyptian-Indian trade routes in Hellenistic and Roman times. (Source: The greatest emporium in the inhabited world, Mostafa El Abbadi, University of Alexandria)

Belief systems and other influencers

The Hindu religion has its own instructional manual. The Laws of Manu, compiled at least 2,000 years ago, by Brahman priests, prescribes for each Varna what to eat, whom to marry, how to earn money, when to fight and how to keep clean (National Geographic, 2003). Manu in particular, marks a critical moment in the orthodox Hindu priestly tradition. It is an attempt at a reconsolidation of an already ancient heritage as well as a reorientation of the heritage around new "principles of life" (dharma). The Dharma Sutras, the earliest of which date to the fourth century and were produced by ritualists, assuming that noble values should guide a moral life in the world (Doniger & Smith, 2003).

Hindu adherents such as Bhavishya Purana predicted that there would be a prophet similar to Judaism's Moses, and there are also a number of parallels in evidence in the Vedas (Varghese et al., 2001). Frawley asserts that there is indeed a great synergy between Jewish and Vedic faith systems (Frawley, 1991). He states that the Hebrew *EI* or *Elohim*, which refers to God the Father, may in essence be the same as the Vedic god II-Varuna. The word Elohim is essentially both a plural and neutral term and he proposes that the Hebrews originally worshipped a multiplicity of gods, just as the Hindus do. In Judaism, God is a transcendental being while in Hinduism, God is equally intrinsic and superior (Bhaskarananda, 1994).

Given that the Jews were in captivity in Babylon, and that the Old Testament was compiled after the Jews were freed by the Persians, it is not unlikely that the Hebrew Bible was subject to Vedic influence either directly or indirectly as was the case with the books of Job and Esther. The Hebrew notion of a Liberator originates from books of Daniel and Ezekiel which were also compiled during the course of the harsh Babylonian captivity and these may also reveal Persian and Hindu inspiration. There are also great similarities in terms of the belief in One supreme being, non-conversion of adherents, oral recitations which are used of the Veda as well as the Torah (Hutter, 2013). The Bible is the word of God in Judaism and it represents the Jewish people's foremost involvement with the Creator and the interpretation of the Divine, but it is not God's last word for all of humanity or even for all time (Frawley, 2009).

Judaism is prominent for its monotheistic notion of God, and has some likeness with certain Hindu scriptures that are monotheistic in orientation, such as, for example, the Vedas (Hutter, 2013; Rinehart, 2004). Diverse Hindu sects have a diversity of beliefs about the nature and identity of god, believing in a wide range of ideas on monotheism, polytheism and pantheism (Rinehart, 2004). If we consider the Upanishads and the Mahabharata, Narayana is the superlative deity (Monier-Williams, 1974). The Shaivite sect consider Shiva to be the highest god while sects such as the Vaishnavites consider Vishnu to be the ultimate God (Morgan, 1987).

By contrast Jews consider God to be the absolute creator of all, omniscient, omnipresent, omnipotent and totally indivisible. In Hinduism, however gods are considered to have a comparable standing to another but are nonetheless distinct deities who may be viewed as unique manifestations of a single, transcendental god (Basham, 1999). Jewish scriptures and traditions impart that there is only one Supreme Being who is the ultimate reality, who has created this world in its diversity and who has shown humanity how to act throughout history.

An ancient religion, Judaism worships the Divine "I am that I am," the Divine Self which is manifestly represented by the sun in the Vedas and Upanishads. God is the ultimate light of lights. Also, the serpent in the Garden of Eden in Mesopotamia, can be likened with the serpent that is in evidence in the Vedas. The Biblical serpent in the creation account (Greek: *ophis*) is similar to Vedic AhiVritra, who is the mortal enemy of Indra. Indra destroys the serpent and the Soma - nectar of immortality, is the fruit of the sacred tree, the tree of knowledge in

Judaism which is also found in the Garden of Eden. The victory of Indra represents the restoration of the soul of man to the Biblical Garden of Eden, which basically represents for the pure state of the soul before its identification with the physical body (Frawley, 1991).

Another important Vedic influence goes back before the Persians when Abraham along with his father Terah journeyed to the city of Haran (Charrhan) before travelling to their Promised Land. Hinduism as well as Judaism have intricate legal codes, pureness codes, and often severe dietary restrictions for their adherents to observe (Mittal and Thursby, 2004). The Levites, who were one of the twelve tribes of Israel, have been closely linked to the Luvian people of Anatolia in modern day Turkey. These people were also Indo-European (Frawley, 1991).

The Old Testament Garden of Eden, was located in the east, in close proximity to India. Noah, whose three sons we are told produced the different peoples of the earth, bear a strong resemblance to the Vedic Yayati. In Hinduism, this entity had five sons who produced the entire world. Amazingly, Both Noah and Yayati split with their offspring and end up being protected by their youngest sons. In the Vedic tradition this refers to Puru, while in the Old Testament it is Japheth who protects Noah. The Old Testament thus in many areas looks a lot like the Puranas of India, which were books containing ancient religious records and long genealogies (Frawley, 1991).

There are also palpable differences between Hinduism and Judaism such as what life is about. For Hindus life is about escape from the human situation, whereas for the Jew it concerns freedom from guilt, sin, and a life of service to Elohim. Jews consider sin to be a grievous infringement of God's laws while for the Hindu, intellectual knowledge deficiency is problematic. Living life for the Hindu requires great human effort, but for the Jew it is also dependent on divine acts. In both religions peace and the pursuit of non-violence are desirable. The main differences between Hinduism and Judaism are theological in nature. While Hindus use images as objects of worship, the Jews abhor this practice and consider it to be idolatry.

Both religions have been highly tolerant of one another and the Jews have never been persecuted by Hindus. There are also no annals reflecting that Hindus ever faced persecution at the hands of Jews. Interestingly, the creation of Israel as a Jewish state was supported by Hindu nationalists, and Israel has always supported India on most global issues. Hindus and Jews far are more than merely a religion, they are each a nation from antiquity, a religion, a great civilisation.

Conclusion

Many technical terms require commentaries to be understood, ritual terminology in particular. It has been suggested that Sanskrit commentaries share the philosophy of people from whom one asks directions in India, hence, one assumes that the native commentators know more than a Western Orientalist knows and the text is embedded in the culture. To paraphrase the Jewish saying: "Whose axe is being bored"? We need to exercise respect and sensitivity towards different religious and cultural groups.

While it is interesting to note the similarities and differences between the two religions, it is imperative that we exercise prudence in understanding the circumstances, the faith and the ritualistic practices of people during a specific time in history. In conclusion, the essence of both traditions is "*Atmanah pratikularni paresham na samachare!*", succinctly stated 'do not do unto others what you do not want to have done to you'.

References

- Alexandru-Corneliu, A. (2015). The Essence of Hindu Doctrine and its Influence on Christianity in America and Europe, *International Journal of Orthodox Theology*, 6:4.
- Basham, A. L. (1999). *A Cultural History of India*, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Bhaskarananda, Swami (1994). *The Essentials of Hinduism: a comprehensive overview of the world's oldest religion*, Viveka Press, Seattle, WA.
- Cornille, C. (Ed.) (2013). *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to Inter-Religious Dialogue*, Wiley-Blackwell, 417.
- Doniger, W. & Smith, B. K. (2003). *The Laws of Manu*, Penguin Books India, New Delhi.
- Dubashi, J. (1987). *The Angry Hindus are Political Hindus*, Probe India, November 1987.
- Fisher, M. P. (2007). *Living Religions*. New York: Prentice Hall, 2007: 151-159.
- Frawley, D. (1991). *Gods, Sages and Kings*, Motilal Banarsi-dass Publishers, Delhi, 280-281.
- Frawley, D. (1995). *Hinduism: The Eternal Tradition-Sanatana Dharma*, Salt Lake City: UT, Passage Press.
- Frawley, D. (2009). *Hinduism: The Eternal Tradition*, Voice of India From http://www.hindubooks.org/david_frawley/hinduism/sanatana_dharma/page16.htm
Accessed on 11 October 2016.
- Goodman, H. (Ed.) (1994). *Between Jerusalem and Benares: Comparative Studies in Judaism and Hinduism*. SUNY Press, 3- 28.
- Gupta, R. & Valpey, K. (2013). *The Bhagavata Purana: Sacred Text and Living Tradition*, Columbia University Press, USA.
- Hutter, M. (2013). Between Mumbai and Manila: Judaism in Asia Since the Founding of the State of Israel (Proceedings of the International Conference, Held at the Department of Comparative Religion. Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht Unipress Göttingen, GmbH., 215.
- Kapoor, S. (2002). *The Indian Encyclopaedia: Hinayana-India* (Central India). Genesis, 2939.
- Mittal, S. & Thursby, G. (2004). *Religions of South Asia: An Introduction*. Routledge, New York, 181.
- Monier-Williams, M. (1974), *Brahmanism and Hinduism: Or, Religious Thought and Life in India, as Based on the Veda and Other Sacred Books of the Hindus*, Elibron Classics, Adamant Media Corporation
- Morgan, K. W., ed. (1987). *The Religion of the Hindus*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsi-das
- National Geographic. NATIONALGEOGRAPHIC.COM AOL KEYWORD: NATGEO, June 2003.
- Prasad, D. (1988). *History of the Andhras up to 1565 A. D.*, P.G. Publishers, Guntur.
- Rinehart, R (Ed.) (2004). *Contemporary Hinduism: Ritual, Culture, and Practice*, ABC-Clio, California.
- Roller, D. (2014). The Geography of Strabo: An English Translation, with Introduction and Notes. Cambridge, UK.

Schoff, W. H. (1912). *The Periplus of the Erythraean Sea: Travel and Trade in the Indian Ocean, by a Merchant of the First century*, Longmans, Green, and Co., New York, 7-15.

Sinha, U.N. & Sinha, R. (2014). Similarities in Indian and Jewish Tradition, *International Journal of Research in Humanities, Arts and Literature*, Vol. 2, Issue 3, March 2014, 59-62.

Srimad-Bhagavatam Retrieved on 20 November 2016 from:
www.harekrnsna.com/philosophy/gss/sadhu/religions/rabbi/rabbi7.htm

The Bible in Basic English. (1956). Cambridge University Press, 349.

Tomalin, E. (2012). *Religions and Development*, London: Routledge, 109.

Van Voorst, R. (2010). *Anthology of World Scriptures*. 7th Ed. Boston: Wadsworth Cengage, 11-25.

Varghese, R. A., Rachel Varghese, R. & Varghese, M. (2001). *God-fleshed: a chronicle of the comings of Christ*, The Crossroad Publishing Company, New York- 66.

Wescott, W.W. (trans). (1887) *Sepher Yetzirah- Book of Creation*, Ch. 6.1

Woodhead, L. & Heelas, P. (2007). *Religion in Modern Times: An Interpretive Anthology*. New York: Willey Blackwell, 2007: 188-191.